

ITH_Box_05_Notebook_05

Mr. Temple

Mr. Temple -
Plato.

July 31, 1915

I 3 main sources for Kemp

1. Pal 2 Gr 3 Rome

Gr passion for intellect in
science & art work. The latter!!

Contrast - but 1 from & now

" " Kemp & now. Esther

recommended as good source
for mod Persia -

The difference is Greece - Europ.
as vs non-Eur.

Passion for intellect supreme
impression in Plato.

Setting for Plato. Gr CS was
established. Political order &
individuality. The last - go
reformation - along his line =
Brit - E.

School of teachers had grown up.
Danger that non-moral infl.
would then turn intellects.
Sophists, rapid growth of
intellectual criticism. Socrates
intellect must have free play,
cross exam of people, especially
the self-satisfied. Asks them
why they don't do wrong.
Make conscience self-critical.
Question not whether S. was
successful in solving prob-
lems - which is S - which
is Plato himself?

Will adopt view that many
of writings - (Plato would not
own whether this is right)
Plato pupil of Socrates -
Cratylus who taught Heraclitus!

3

philosophy - Eternal flux.

"weeping philosopher. We are used
to it - and it doesn't disturb us.
Perpet. change in world, does
moral rule change too? Plato
had pass. conviction that
moral certainty was possible.
This he got from Socrates - com-
bined this with ^{Heracl.} Plato's change.
Order of the dialogues now fixed.
In early dial. asks "Can virtue
be taught?" esp. rhetoric.
In Protagoras takes up this ques-
tion, continues it in Meno.
Can be taught if men get true
knowledge of it - but opinion
is not knowledge. Right-
opinion may be same as truth
at the moment.

Right opinion + reason for it =
knowledge - Says Them, Peicles
had right opinion but not knowl.
but ^{couldn't} ~~didn't~~ explain them to
children or impart it to them.
Plato interested in practical
reform -

When seen abt. diff. bet right
opinion applies it in Gorgias -
Socrates was first real state-
man, Them - Per. were not
because they had only ships
builds etc, not justice
Syrae. exhibition - great
festival of jingoism - This
- view of Thales etc. did not
impress him with nat.
greatness

How recognize knowledge?
Soul can reconstruct whole
fabric because it was once
part of it. States it dogmatic
based on Pindar (revelation)
Pln. = recollecting what we have
known before birth. Unity
of the world is what he believes
important -

Cratylus (he & Soc are speakers)
at end of dial. S asks are
there permanent ideas - forms
of things which can always be
recognized and which remain
eternal in spite of change in
persons? Skelton illustration.
Change in dialogues here but -
Cratylus (hesitating) & Symposium
& Phaedo (certainty)

End of Symposium - Diotima, passage
from rich sea of beauty to
eternal - ideal beauty.

Diotima thinks this ^{expresses} was a
great blaze of light in Plato.
Revealed truth wh. makes sense.
Understand some personal appl.
of Shelley Hymn to Int. Beauty
Pl. in Symposium with or without
that vision believes in ideal
beauty which cannot change
these circumstances -

Phaedo applies not only to beauty
but age, health etc. These
exist in virtue of certain ideal
quality. Geometry, principles
of Δ in general, not Δ in particular
This practices principles of
Plato, whose favorite study it
was.

7

World of ideas discovered. But
comes back to politics in Rep.
In meantime find Anaxagoras,
no rational acct. of world on
line in which he had hoped for.
Only rational appl. will be in
terms of the good. In ideal world
in Rep. practically metaphys.
principles. Ideal world order
by idea of good. governing
principles in Plato's ethics &
politics - Marks out provinces
of sciences, laws of behavior
etc. - Relat of realm of ideas
to our phys. disapp. world.
This raises problem of will in
acute state. Demand his
way. world really opposed
to cutting the knot.

The idea

Fact (reality as distinct from fiction) - See what happens if we substitute it for idea in Pl. dialogue. This world is half illusory. Fact of justice fact of beauty etc. more general

Saw than just deeds, beautiful things^{etc.}

Science wishes to draw up general statement of law & it doesn't matter if the law really comes off. Law not facts themselves but concerning the facts. Valid of the facts.

Meaning, printed page = so much printer's ink in funny shapes, but it is Shaks. (e.g.)

Trust, demands for truth of things shows we are not satisfied with every day casual experience.

9

Phil has to get seriousness
" factist with ∴ of scientist-

Pl. theory of ideas has strong logical basis, not merely a poetic vision.

Scientific value, elevating moral power. He then criticises him-
self. Phaedrus (immortality)

Interval of several years

Parmenides crit. his earlier views ^{Symp.} Beaut. of things, shares ultimate beauty,

In Theatetus seems to begin again. New fabric, all material.

Pytho his earlier def. of knowledge - Is it sensation?

Thinks soul sees & hears things

eyes - ears. Origin must be
in mind itself - not in senses.
Being - not being,
unity - plurality - (4 184-6)
Insight - across centuries to Kant
Simplicity in Plato makes it
sound easy - All later philo
is there, you won't see it at
first, but go back again -
Pl. asked all questions, & sug-
gests your answer.
In Theat.

Hegelean treatment of negation
A is not B, really has a
positive value. (2 RR stations)

pb
236
260

Find it in Plato, Sophist.
How can you think of something
which is not? Negation as
fundamental as posit. statement.

11

See Spinoza's idea of God &
Kant's answers -
No phil. etc. wh. we see in Pl.

Starts w. belief of moral
Cult. but the truth is not
perceived by ordinary men -
not reached by senses - every-
day experience - Idea of god
governs whole system of thought
God = thought or purpose
of god - Not a dead thing out-
living principles -

Why did god make the world?
Bc. he was good - free from
jealousy - Almost can say
it was his desire to
show it with men. Cf
doctrines of XT

This
29E
Sheet
176A

II Ethics and Politics

Must be taken together in Plato as well as every other gr. writer on v. subj. - Both deal w. relat. of man in society. Morality, as an actual fact, concerns relat. of human beings in an estab. community. Science ^{and} or art of social life, subj. is capable of sc. study, rules rationally determ. not by appeal to feeling or conventions. Reason never creates, but organizes. Cannot prove rules of morality or anything else, same must work on facts. We begin with fact of obligation & morality, recognize claims of others in society. Social life a mere episode in immortal life of man. Plato believed hum. soul exists before & after death, re-incar-

nation, only if invariable in vice it
goes to eternal punishment; conversely
the perfect soul converses w. - gods.
This life important in its influence
on eternal life - prep. for life after.
Plato's ideal state is designed to
this end - A good const. prod.
in - soul a healthy condition.
Arist. believed in eternity of spirit
or reason but not in individual
immortality. This dep. on our matter
knowing must here & now, where this
is removed individuality goes.
Arist. has no criterion of polit. excell.
Stability his chief standards.
Polit. & moral standard cut off
from each other. of Tuitcheskes
Pratt & ours :: Arist. : Plato.
As. nothing beyond the state,

15

to Plato State is a mere episode.
In Pl. ideal state King - Philos -
(tho' phil. are generally unpract.
- difficult) Pl. says those men
are best phil. Soc. was the only
man Pl. would have entrusted with
such power Govt to rule in
light is he ascertained truth.
eg. the meaning of universals -
purpose of god. he may determine
this purpose in general, not in detail
Pl. confesses he does not know & for
himself & would though he thought
it could be ascertained.

Rep. begins w. justice in & indiv.
but he says in use & mind equally
of state. ∴ study state where
we can see it on larger scale -
Thinks to ~~rest~~ idea of good govt.
order.

Every part performs its own function
but not only doesn't interfere
with others. This is justice.

Polymachus's view - render to every
man what is due him. Rights
or duties? In an ideal state it is
OK but otherwise makes diff.

Whether one emph. rights or duties,
justice has no dept. of it - own as it
covers all depts. See Cook, de,
bootmaker etc.

Thrasym. really a further devel. of
same person, but must be a new
char (couldn't have 5 year interval).

Oxford Pol. or Thrasymachi - Cynic
can't be consistent, must catch
him somewhere \therefore come to

Gl. + Adimantus (reformer)

Gl (philosopher, ideal)

17

They believe justice is good but
cannot prove it, have been tho'
dogmatism - cynicism. State
this difficult to draw out Plato,
Dkt. of social contract - all vs. each
orig. of state - selfish but would have
formed it anyway. Selfish or
competitive, also cooperative -
this must be supreme. Fellowship
not antagonism deepest thing in
human nature. Ideal state will
not be utop. or ideal but psych-
on the nature of soul. Phil-
court. spring out of moral standard
accepted by the citizens. This
standard will be impressed on
minds of rising generation. One
state of soul is supremely right -
one supremely wrong, most court.

come but v two. Const: reflects & keeps, moral standards & v cits. No abs. moral rules etc. & supreme excellence of justice.

Arist. opportunist, enduring const
" intuitionist has in field
of battle he. it is noble & base is
base - Arist says "all good men
agree" - Has cut apart & supreme
life of soul from v state.

Contemplation of eternal truths,
practical virtue not a part of it
No final standard in polit. or
ethics, good pract. suggests
utilitarian, useful = noble,
harmful = base - Pleasure is
generally v end - End for Plato
is justice, state of soul which
is healthy, ∴ his ^{opinion} ~~opinion~~

19

diff. from Bentham or Mill.

"Pl. The moral state of soul is alone
good in itself. Not what will
further practical ends, increase
wealth, etc. happiness of v st. no.
Rep II, III & part IV. Indiv. & state.
Const spring for moral credit of v
soul, to make it clear makes."

3 dir. of state, 3 of soul (works
out on broad principles, not details)
Analysis of the soul (tho other
comes first in book, it is made
to open with an. of soul).

What are what in sh. man can
stand to another, only 3

1. Ignorance
2. Complacency
3. Envy

Can combine 2 & 1

State of mind of 1 (ign). he calls "desire", no ref. to anyone else hungry. If gives food to another while he is hungry is the virtue. May be phys. desires or unnecessary things, luxury, wealth etc.

2. *Thymos* "spirit" - a man of spirit - "temper", individualist - desires if left to selves are anarchical within & soul itself has no regard to whole person ignore whole self as well as others Honor or glory is highest thing it seeks, self-assertion.

Spirit of effective competition.

3 Reason essentially cooperative to understand relat. bet parts & whole, ref to state etc. fellowship. For this reason /

rational fac. is fitted to rule "all. it sees the whole thing" philo king.

next below comes honor for state to fulfill its indir. when desires are satisfied but not indulged

Ideal state a perfect harmony w. reason supreme

viii - ix evil states, Sparta (Pr.) glory of state & cit. in it Reason as power of ruling whole purpose no longer supreme.

In olig. a curant for desires (respectable ones, wealth etc) are supreme. In what he calls democ (what we call anarch) all desires run riot, everyone does as he likes.

↳ tyranny, desire is supreme & rules everything

ty. abs power but unequal to her it

Phil King = qualified for it.

These apply to indiv. & states both, 5 stages.

Pl. made fun of Pythagoreans who overdid theory of mystic numbers.

1 Royalty = Democracy 3 Plat

5 in 3, mult by 9, ^{cube} it 927 etc. whole thing is a rag of the mystic numbers.

Formidable net. of moral talk image of man, human outside

23

monster inside (desire)

lim (self assertion) small man within himself. Small man (humanity) must - rule over him a monster.

∴ st. starts on edge. Educ = pivot for the state. In principle is profoundest discuss of educ in lit.

Primary obj in early stage = train passions, not intellect. Love & hate & right things, when reason comes they will see why - of this

Only if purposes are moral should educ come

"If man is known let him be a fool."

Should not learn it by experi -

must be. it vitiate & some. Not
strenuous in being clear or they
vitiates instrument of judgment.
No evil in environment (child)
must have attractive good things
about.

Aptitude, training must test
it by temptation & if person
is OK can go on to higher educ.
But can't ed. through intellect
alone, must lead him first
and then fashion into rational
whole.

No justification of justice
itself, can only depict the ideal
& set it before people to accept or
reject - not pleasure, not hope.
penis (Christ) right - subord. to
agreeable.

25

wants to make goodness attractive
though he doesn't do so himself.
"too austere. Doesn't make &
governing whole share w. & parts -
see Ezekiel who reads vs. his
tenderness in God - Plato stern
and somewhat repellent he
cannot quite go to his doctrine
/ has pitched too high ideal -
offers no power by wh. it can
be reached.

In Pl. scheme of politics women
are equally obj. as men for all
functions etc. where phys. strength
is in question.

Arist. doesn't agree, and is
checked but Pl. argues from animals.
He says they have no home life
& this is place for women.

III Platonism and Christianity.

1.

Doctrine of immort. not taught by
Pl. for 1st time in Gr. all Gk
peoples had idea of life after death.
Hom. life a very miserable affair.
Shadowy time, no matter of after-
Another form comm. in Orphians.
Dion is inclined to think he was
Dion priest who substituted
music for alcohol as means to
goal of Dion. worship. Twisting
symbol I Cor XIII. More primitive
worshippers didn't find it a good
substitute, increased love him to be
Orph. life after death = phase of
pen. of judgment, blessed or a
punishment. Existed chiefly
in secret brotherhoods. Perhaps
See

belonged. How much of it in St. Myst?
Plato's lay. not soul's vision of truth
is dream from El M. Darkness into
light, sudden revelation of bright light.

It seems to adapt this side of both.

In Neuro adapts it on authority
of Quindar - other gr. teachers.

In Phaedo are 4 arguments

First 3 are known to be invalid
support belief & do not clinch.

Valid but not for purpose for which

70 D 1. Opposites spring from opposites
Cold to hot, alive to dead, etc in
any change - If take creature
dead to life, then soul exists
before birth.

Can only be 1 const. no. of souls
whose body dies and must go
to others, otherwise all die -

29

Mod. people have little diff. in

72 D believing no of souls ever.

2. If knowl = recollection of
what we have known before death

78 D 3. Ideas simple & eternal & soul
has an affinity w. eternal world
∴ it too eternal -

All these arg. are advanced &
then dismissed, suggests they
form ground of Plat. that soul is
at least higher level than body
& can reincarnate, but it
doesn't prove it eternal. Soul
might die before body, exists.

4. Tho' true that opps. arise fr.
opp. no quality never becomes
its own opposite. Heat cannot
become chill, light cannot be
darkness ∴ life cannot be
death

If obj. has one phisic idea or
but it can't change in herent
prop. Not hot snow

1021) ∴ soul can never admit of death
This proves that soul cannot
not be dead, but it does not
follow that soul simply vanishes
away - Proves it deathless
but not immortal. May go
out as fire goes out.
Real arg. is attitude ^{pos.} of soul at
time of his death. No com-
plaint, no jailer's cuffs, calm
and. "One a cord to dex, see it
is fair." Gift of poor man for
healing - "I'm getting well now
give god his gift." Compare
w. life after death - pre. life is
disease from wh. one recovers.

31

Rep 8 When he has proved goodness
in his nature
always preferable to vice, says
"this is a short time compared
w. eternity." "How you not ob-
servant that soul is immortal?"
Everything wh. kills it does so by
its own disease. Only this creature
disease in body that it is killed
Soul not killed by its own dis-
ease wh. is unjust & unjust
flourish.

Phaedrus Evid of life is motion, capacity
245C to move itself. If its source of
motion is really within self it
has source of vitality within
self - no reason why it should
cease. Arg. from free will to
immortality. See Laws II.
All v arg. estab. is that spirit

(not in his spirit, yours or mine)
is eternal. In Timaeus & creation
is up. as saying to lesser spirits
that he alone is eternal in his
own life & they are in nature of
immort. conferred on them. Cf
Mt Sons of God. In acc. or Orphism
it is believed that souls after
death spend on earth here.
Believe is that some souls are
picks to depart to presence of
gods to dwell for ever more,
warning for some, others depart
for 1000 years during wh. life is
deter. by life here, then can
choose destiny for new incarnat.
This is supreme crisis for
soul if man has been virtuous
but without Philo, he will be

33

^{during}
or ~~in~~ 1000 years, but will not
know how to choose since his
virtue has no basis in reason.
Lachesis proclaims to choosing
souls that destinies are spread out
for you to choose, responsibility
lies with the chooser, god is
planless. We were free once to
choose our destiny tho' we are
not free here -

Elein. punishments, all remedial
or deterrent. Retribution pun.
has no place in his thought, no
trace of vindictiveness. Some
souls are incurable tho' vice
& their only use is to serve as a
warning to others.

Myth at end of Rep. - Soul of
Archelaus & qt, has been tyrant,

hurled back again into torment
because his state was incurable.
If you add that no soul reaches
a state where it is really incurable
or omnipotent god
you will be

Are to suffer in other world 10 times
or injury or love voluntarily
implicit or explicit in this life.
Speaks of gods of Dante. Thought-
Cap. an invisible spirit-capable
of imparting to men. But gods
are spirits. Plato as much
more. as sea. all good is
author only of what is good, of
less than our experience.
Where does it come from. Are
evil soul of world / to good end,
but this doesn't answer it.

RE
279

35

only
Thoreau step back, take Milton
for it. Doesn't say why Satan
rebelled. Human minds so glad
to get over one brick wall they
don't worry about the next.

That. If we know good only by
contr. w. evil we appreciate it all
the more. never explains quest.
of evil. Is it defects of matter?
Why has matter got defects?

God is author of good only, yet he
is controller of whole world, & seems
suprem. of good over evil, creates
world, ^{but} free from jealousy &
wishing to share it. of X
One enormous difference.

Justice, in the soul or in state
that is - gov. power of world,
under name of idea of good.

justice should manage what is
due from him - do on point
of becoming love, on point of saying
God is love, but shrinks at
critical moment -

Rep VII
519E

Ideal Philo. when he beheld
eternal truth must gov. city
in deed. m. then. trusts they
have seen - Civiliq. has no claim
on him - he may pursue his
beat. vision undisturbed. But
society requires Philo. to use
his gifts for them - Not a
word abt. willingness of self sacrific-
ice, no idea of finding one's
fulfillment in giving one's life
for others. Comes up to it - then
sheds off. Yet he knew value
of Soc. martyrdom.

37

One pleases when his conscience
thinks says behind his intuition.
"Greater man than Philo
objects to art. It is merely
an imitation, inferior to
reality.

Yet he knew perfectly well that
art is its nearer ideal than
most people see Rep V says an
artist may create a piece more
beautiful than any force that
ever existed. Reality - theory
do not agree -

De Phialo knows value of Philo, but
speaks of it as a weakness.

know val. of sacrificial death
of Soc. but doesn't put it in
his theory - Cannot complete
that O.

No one said it until when after
death of Christ people said they
had been witnessing a nature of god.
Prep for NT

1. Spirit of his thought from inner
world to something else is not
other than ours but supplies
its true interpretation.
From time theologians of NT
under Pl influence, esp. St
Athanasius (not author of Ath
creed wh. he never saw) - Nicene
creed all in Platonic terms
"one substance - like substance"
Before w. Plato's all things
are transitory or eternal. In
this world things are liable to
decay.

NT believed divine substance

39

or power but mingled with
humanity

"This makes all the diff. but
"same" & "like" - all they will
to say they quarrel over one
letter but point is whether
church was to be home of pract-
sels. or debating society -

African would have

What man really needs is God
not something like God.

There is his belief in a spiritual
city eternally in heaven or
idea of beauty, justice etc.

Citizenship in heaven, etc.
city in spiritual world. Plato

reinforced by other of early church
one of governing principles of NT.

St Paul's Ch. has idea of fellow
citizens

ship but finds really that kind
r idea of Pl. spiritual city ::
people will understand his view.
At any. at least up of Rome falls
back on Plat belief in city
of God. It can survive fall of
Rome for be their home is
in city of Pl.

Med Ch. almost embodies
them

Govt in hands of those who had
vision of eternal truth, next
below come warrior class sub.
serv. to ruling class using
their strength to help, below
come craftsmen etc -

Bec. of failure to make supr.
governments attractive or appealing
had descend kind people in gen.

41

can know it - They are the
"right parables" "no lie"
part of the truth be. they can't
take it all in

of Med Ch. - supreme power
of Pope gov. in ecc. or known
resort. will fight

king - barons to fight at
pope's orders (Crusades)

Ord. mass of cities. whose help.
is the chief concern of rulers
but who are not to have any
share in govt.

Pl. ideal state had flaws
but was loftier ideal than
what people have tried on
large scheme since. Med Ch.

In now believe whole people
can - ought to take part

in apprehension of truth -
control in Plat. desc.

This he. being that supreme
goodness not in awful solit
to wh man can look, but

Formation period of N- desc. is
Plat. Desc - Desc. Then ch. moved
gradually ff to Arist who is
- Philo of the established thing -
To systematize opinions of
respectable ~~ages~~ cit. in dicto
Treats ethics as phys. treats
facts he observes. Manages to
show they were in a syst. of
truth

Plato concerned in what shall
we do to inherit eternal life.
Philos of
Creation - formation periods -

43

But we can't always create, must
codify + classify to go on with,
here we use Arist. greatest gift
of analysis

In Med Arist governs hardly he.
nuptial. was Desc. Moore
brought comment. on Arist.
st. Tho. Aquinas begins w. &
assumption that bible + Arist
is always right - if they don't
agree he thinks a 3^d thing -
Ren = rediscovery of Plato -

Recherches p.e spread this best
+ bright - above all Plato, mainly
+ work of Plato - Thought is not
to systematize but to press
forward to horizon of truth
at any. down to wisdom
from Plato, didn't know

him at, at least but this Neo
Platonist.

Our movement prog. f mod
world all Gk.

Plato - fruit - fruit burst - spiritual
ness - in him & Gk spirit
reaches its climax - burst -
there is to be something greater
even than Gk Cs - some character
will come, see him out &
follow him.

Gk passage f in utter